ELECTIONS SASKATCHEWAN CHIEF ELECTORAL OFFICER'S ASSESSMENT

Toward a Permanent Register of Voters for Saskatchewan

October 2013





OFFICE OF THE CHIEF ELECTORAL OFFICER (ELECTIONS SASKATCHEWAN) 1702 PARK STREET, REGINA, SASKATCHEWAN CANADA S4N 6B2

TELEPHONE: (306) 787-4000 / 1-877-958-8683 FACSIMILE: (306) 787-4052 / 1-866-678-4052

WEB SITE: www.elections.sk.ca

OCTOBER 2013

ISBN 978-0-9921510-0-3

TOWARD A PERMANENT REGISTER OF VOTERS FOR SASKATCHEWAN - CHIEF ELECTORAL OFFICER'S ASSESSMENT—2013-1 (v2.0)





OFFICE OF THE CHIEF ELECTORAL OFFICER

October 29, 2013

The Honourable Dan D'Autremont Speaker of the Legislative Assembly 129 Legislative Building Regina, Saskatchewan S4S 0B3

Honourable Speaker:

I have the distinct privilege of presenting *Toward a Permanent Register of Voters for Saskatchewan*, a publication within the Chief Electoral Officer's Assessment series, to the Legislative Assembly of Saskatchewan.

Respectfully submitted,

Michael Boda, D.Phil., Ph.D. Chief Electoral Officer

inhald. Bedr

Province of Saskatchewan



Executive Summary (3)

About Elections Saskatchewan (5)

Our Values (5)
Our Responsibilities (6)

1.0 Introduction (9)

2.0 Purpose of Voter Registration (9)

3.0 Enumeration and Revision (10)

The Challenges of Enumeration (10)

Access to Voters (10)

Privacy and Personal Safety (10)

Recruiting and Retaining Enumerators (10)

Rural vs. Urban Enumeration (11)

Quality of the Information Collected (11)

Labour Costs (11)

Summary (11)

4.0 Permanent Register of Voters (12)

5.0 Enumeration vs. Permanent Register (13)

Currency (13)

Coverage (14)

Accuracy (15)

Other Factors to Consider (15)

Timeliness (15)

Security and Privacy (15)

Alerting Voters (16)

6.0 Comparing the Costs (17)

Enumeration Costs (17)

Permanent Register Costs (17)

Development Costs (17)

Maintenance Costs (18)

Target Enumeration Costs (19)

Cost Saving of a Permanent Register of Voters (19)

7.0 Timing of Implementation (20)

8.0 Guiding Principles (21)

9.0 Recommendations (23)

Board of Internal Economy Consensus (23) Legislative Amendments (23) Additional Resources (23)

Acknowledgements (24)



Executive Summary

Since 2004 there have been calls for a permanent register of voters to replace enumeration as the preferred approach to registering voters in Saskatchewan. This move was recommended by an all-party committee looking at amendments to *The Election Act, 1996* and by the head of Elections Saskatchewan.

Elections Saskatchewan has been preparing for a change towards a permanent register of voters. Its election management information system was developed to accommodate a permanent register of voters, and the organization has been positioning itself for the transition by recommending other legislative changes that would support the introduction of a register. While some of the supporting changes have been put in place, such as set date elections and the ability to conduct enumeration outside of the writ period, there is still no authority to create and maintain a permanent register of voters for Saskatchewan. Currently, Saskatchewan is one of only three Canadian provinces and territories that do not compile their voters lists using a permanent register. The other jurisdictions are the Yukon and Manitoba.

Voter registration is important to determine whether individuals qualify to vote. It serves to protect the integrity of the voting process by ensuring that only eligible voters will be given access to the voting booth. The list is used at the polls to screen prospective voters—ensuring that only those entitled to vote are given a ballot and that people are only permitted to vote once. The voters list has also become a critical tool for political parties and candidates for the purposes of identifying, tracking and campaigning for voter support. In addition, it is essential for election administrators in establishing polling divisions and estimating how many polling stations are needed, as well as determining where to deploy polling day workers.

The traditional approach to compiling the list of voters has been through door-todoor enumeration. The list that is compiled is discarded after the election and the process begins again every four years in preparation for the next election. This is a labour intensive and costly activity. Today, however, fewer people are at home when the enumerator calls and people are becoming more reluctant to open their doors to someone they do not know. It is also becoming increasingly more difficult to recruit enumerators. The overall quality of the voters list can suffer from all of these factors. For these reasons, most jurisdictions in Canada have transitioned to a continuously updated permanent register of voters.

A permanent register of voters is a regularly updated database of eligible voters. It is usually produced the first time from a "final" enumeration and then is updated and maintained on an ongoing basis using a variety of public sector data sources. In addition to the names and addresses of voters, a permanent register will contain date of birth information and may provide a unique identification number that can be used for record linking. Voters lists can be produced from a permanent register whenever necessary for use in provincial elections, local elections or by-elections. With minor legislative changes, it can be distributed between elections for use by Members and political parties. Up-to-date lists can also be used to revise polling division boundaries between elections or when constituency boundaries change as a result of redistribution.

Since enumeration usually occurs in close proximity to the election event, it is usually very current. However, the coverage or completeness of a voters list produced from a permanent register can be superior to an enumerated list, principally because it is being continuously updated and is not

recollected before each election. The coverage of a voters list prepared through enumeration is dependent on the completeness of the enumeration effort and is subject to a variety of factors that may not always be within the control of election administrators.

The major benefit of establishing a permanent register of voters is significant cost avoidance. Saskatchewan's last enumeration cost \$2.58 million. Enumeration costs will be incurred every four years and will only increase every election cycle. The majority of these costs would not need to be incurred with a move to a permanent register. The initial development costs of establishing a permanent register for Saskatchewan have been estimated at \$125,000. This minimal amount of upfront expenditure is possible because Elections Saskatchewan already has an election management system that can house records that form the permanent register. The other cost component of a permanent register is the ongoing maintenance. The annual costs of keeping a permanent register up-to-date are estimated to be \$328,400. Over a four-year election cycle, the cost savings of moving to a permanent register would be more than \$880,000.

Elections Saskatchewan is well positioned to develop a permanent register of voters for Saskatchewan. It will require legislative changes to *The Election Act* to provide authority for register development in advance of the next general election, the approval of additional information technology (IT) resources to begin development work, and one final enumeration to establish the basis of the register.

lichald. Edr

Michael D. Boda, D.Phil., Ph.D. Chief Electoral Officer Province of Saskatchewan



About Elections Saskatchewan

The many component parts involved in planning, organizing and implementing elections in Saskatchewan are overseen by what is often described as an election management body (EMB). In Canada, an EMB is an independent, nonpartisan institution that is responsible for neutral election administration within a jurisdiction governed as a democracy.

In this province, Elections Saskatchewan fulfills this mandate, serving as secretariat to the statutory Office of Chief Electoral Officer. Elections Saskatchewan has a leadership team based at its head office in Regina and dispersed across the province's 61 newly defined constituencies that will each elect a Member of the Legislative Assembly in the upcoming 28th General Election.

In the months leading to a general election, Saskatchewan's electoral service grows to include about 10,000 provincial residents from all walks of life, each serving provincial voters in implementing an event that is fundamental to sustaining Saskatchewan's democratic traditions.

OUR VALUES

Elections Saskatchewan's values are:

- To be independent and nonpartisan, ensuring public confidence in the independence of Elections
 Saskatchewan and its activities by treating all stakeholders equally and without preference.
- To have integrity, making certain that every decision and every action enhances the democratic rights of all electors by interpreting and applying legislation and policy fairly and consistently.
- To be open and transparent in all activities through consistency of action, regular public reporting, broad communications and information sharing between and during electoral events.
- To be accountable to electors and the Members of the Saskatchewan Legislative Assembly through statutory reporting of activity and performance against published standards and the requirements of

- legislative and regulatory frameworks for electoral events and election finances.
- To be efficient in designing processes and ensuring financial accountability through the development, management and deployment of upto-date and cost-effective technology, processes, access channels and tools that encourage maximum participation and facilitate maximum compliance with financial reporting obligations.
- To be effective in electoral event delivery procedures and operations, to minimize barriers to compliance, participation and access to the electoral process for electors, candidates and parties and to ensure election workers are well prepared, processes are well designed and performance measurement systems are in place.
- To be innovative, creative and flexible in delivering present obligations and preparing for the future, looking broadly for opportunities and



partnerships while considering electoral process needs and adopting optimal solutions.

- To be consultative with all of our stakeholders, using advisory committees to evaluate legislative, regulatory and operational frameworks to ensure that they are current and relevant, regularly reviewing all stakeholder perspectives and needs, and sharing evaluations of Elections Saskatchewan's performance.
- To be professional in all our activities by bringing to Saskatchewan the best practices in electoral administration from across Canada and democracies around the world.
- To create a cooperative work environment and encourage all members of the Elections
 Saskatchewan team to work together, and with Elections Saskatchewan's stakeholders and partners, to better serve the electorate of Saskatchewan.

OUR RESPONSIBILITIES

The Head Office Leadership Team

The Chief Electoral Officer (CEO) is an independent officer of the Saskatchewan Legislature. As head of Elections Saskatchewan, the CEO ensures the fair and equitable conduct of operational, administrative and financial electoral practices. The CEO is assisted in these legislated responsibilities by a head office leadership team.

Elections Saskatchewan's primary responsibility is to maintain a state of provincial election readiness. To that end, Elections Saskatchewan must appoint and train requisite numbers of constituency returning officers and election officials to ensure electoral preparedness throughout the government's mandate.

The Election Act, 1996 places a duty on the CEO to assist registered political parties, candidates, chief official agents and business managers to ensure The Election Act's financial transparency and disclosure goals are met. Elections Saskatchewan publishes guides for chief official agents and business managers to

help them fulfill their administrative and financial reporting responsibilities and compile requisite support documentation, and to ensure annual financial disclosures are undertaken in accordance with both The Election Act and The Political Contributions Tax Credit Act, 2001 (Saskatchewan).

Where applicable, Elections
Saskatchewan is responsible for
assessing and reimbursing election
expenses paid from the province's
General Revenue Fund. Elections
Saskatchewan has established a financial
review system to certify public
reimbursement of election expenses
through the examination and audit of
registered political parties' and
candidates' expense returns and requisite
disclosure documentation. To promote
transparency, expense return details are
tabled in the Legislative Assembly.

Elections Saskatchewan is also responsible for investigating offences under *The Election Act*. While *The Election Act* is regulatory rather than criminal, the role of Elections Saskatchewan is to inspect, investigate and inquire about instances where

contravention of *The Election Act* is suspected or alleged, as deemed necessary by the CEO. Since this responsibility is a matter of considerable discretion and is often initiated by complaints filed by interested parties, it is incumbent upon Elections Saskatchewan to consider whether any specific situation has abrogated the overall purpose, policy rationale and/or legislative intent of the province's electoral legislation.

Elections Saskatchewan maintains an outreach program to ensure political stakeholders and the public are aware of important aspects of Elections Saskatchewan's mandate by responding to public enquiries and liaising with registered political parties, candidates and their chief official agents and business managers.

The CEO reports annually to the speaker of the Legislative Assembly on matters related to *The Election Act*. In addition to such annual reporting, the CEO also prepares and tables reports in the Legislative Assembly on all electoral events. Provincial election results are published in the *Statement of Votes* (Volume I) and its complement, the *Report of the Chief Electoral Officer: Campaign Contributions and Expenditures (Volume*

II). Administrative and financial reporting of constituency by-elections is encapsulated in individual *Statement of By-Election* reports.

The environment within which Elections Saskatchewan is accountable is unique and complex due to the potential uncertainty of the provincial electoral cycle, the decentralized nature of electoral administration, and the interaction among registered political parties, candidates and the electorate. The integration of this decentralized process among the province's political stakeholders rests with Elections Saskatchewan and its centralized administration and impartial application of *The Election Act*.

The Field Leadership Team

While central electoral administration is the responsibility of Elections Saskatchewan's head office leadership team, regional and constituency-level conduct of electoral events is the responsibility of a field leadership team.

Supervisory returning officers (SROs), each representing a different zone of the province comprising six or seven constituencies, are responsible for assisting the returning officers within

those constituencies in performing their duties. SROs receive their direction from Elections Saskatchewan, act as a liaison between Elections Saskatchewan head office and the constituency returning officers, and are responsible for ensuring electoral events are administered and conducted to a consistently high standard across the province.

An important part of maintaining election readiness is having constituency returning officers for all of the province's 61 constituencies. The CEO appoints the constituency returning officers. Notices of all such appointments/cancellations are published in *The Saskatchewan Gazette*. Returning officer vacancies are filled by an independent merit-based competition.

As representatives of Elections
Saskatchewan, constituency returning
officers are entrusted with upholding the
neutrality of the province's decentralized
electoral process within the constituency
and are responsible for the
administration, conduct and reporting of
electoral proceedings (general or byelections, referendums and plebiscites).



1.0 Introduction

In the 2004 report of Saskatchewan's allparty committee on revisions to The Election Act, 1996, it was unanimously recommended that a permanent register of voters be developed. The development of such a register was to be based on a final enumeration completed outside of an election period. When other amendments to The Election Act were introduced in the Legislative Assembly in 2005, the Minister of Justice at the time called the introduction of a permanent list of voters the most important amendment to The Election Act. Although it was anticipated that enabling legislation and regulations would soon follow, no further provisions were enacted to permit the development of a permanent register of voters for Saskatchewan.

Following the 2007 provincial general election, Elections Saskatchewan recommended to the Legislative Assembly that legislative amendments be developed to permit the creation of a permanent register of voters. The Legislative Assembly and Executive Council Act. 2007 was amended in 2008 to give Saskatchewan a four-year set date schedule for elections. With a predictable date for the 2011 election, this paved the way for Elections Saskatchewan to conduct a provincewide enumeration before the writs of election were issued. In August 2011, just prior to the November 7, 2011 general election, regulations were put in place to permit enumeration to occur outside the writ period.

In February 2012, the Board of Internal Economy asked Elections Saskatchewan to analyze the costs and operational impact of a permanent register as compared with enumeration. The following report offers insight into the Chief Electoral Officer's findings, providing a recommendation on instituting a permanent register of voters as part of a path for renewal that focuses on Saskatchewan's approach to administering electoral events.

2.0 Purpose of Voter Registration

The fundamental purpose of a voter registration system is to determine whether individuals qualify as voters according to the eligibility criteria established in law. It serves to maintain the integrity of the voting process by restricting access to the voting booth. A properly prepared voters list ensures that only those people entitled to vote in a given poll can do so, and that they can only vote once.

Lists of eligible voters also facilitate voting operations by helping election administrators determine how many voting stations they need to set up, how many election workers they need to hire, and to calculate voter turnout. A comprehensive voters list also reduces the number of people that have to register to vote on polling day, thereby alleviating line-ups and congestion for others. Voters lists are also used by parties and candidates for political purposes—to mobilize the participation of voters during campaigns and between elections.

Voters lists, in various forms, have been prepared since the late 1800s. Today, there are two basic methods used in Canada to register voters. One is to conduct an enumeration and the other is to develop and maintain a permanent list of voters.



3.0 Enumeration and Revision

Since 1917 and until very recently, voters were registered for territorial, provincial and federal elections through enumeration. For election administrators, this involved subdividing larger political areas variously called constituencies, electoral districts or divisions into smaller geographic units and appointing enumerators to visit each household within an assigned area. The enumerators would go door-to-door to establish a resident's eligibility, collect the necessary voter information and compile a list of those entitled to vote. The process often required several visits to find people at home.

Enumeration was usually accomplished within ten to fourteen days. Traditionally this occurred after the election had been called, as there were no set dates for elections until very recently. Until 2011, The Election Act, 1996 required an enumeration to be conducted immediately following the issuing of the writs. However, with the passage of new Enumerations can now take place during a two and a half week period prior to the date set for a general election.

The lists resulting from enumeration in Saskatchewan are used solely for the election at hand, or possibly for another proximal event such as a by-election, and then discarded.

Following enumeration there is a short period of revision. This is similar to an appeals process, whereby voters not enumerated may be registered and objections to those on the lists may be heard. The final way to be entered on the voters list is at the polls - where qualified voters left off the list can be registered by

providing proof of identity and residence, swearing an oath, or having another voter vouch for their identities.

The enumeration process relies heavily on the element of trust – trust that people will honestly report to enumerators their citizenship, residency within the polling division and age – and thus their eligibility to vote. Enumerators are not permitted to challenge the veracity of the information they receive at the doorstep. Suspect entries on the voters list may be challenged during revision and by poll officials and candidate representatives at the voting station.

THE CHALLENGES OF ENUMERATION

The process of going door-to-door to register voters and create a voters list for specific use in elections has met several challenges in recent years. Emerging social, demographic, technological and political changes have made the enumeration approach to voter registration more difficult. These challenges have been reported for decades by election administrators, as well as academics who have studied this method of voter registration.

Access to Voters

It has become increasingly difficult for enumerators to find people at home when they call. This concern was noted as far back as 1991 in the report of the Royal Commission on Electoral Reform and Party Financing. Large numbers of voters appear to be absent from their homes - quite possibly away for work or lifestyle-related reasons. It has also been reported by enumerators and returning officers in Saskatchewan and other places that

it is becoming more difficult to obtain the contact information for persons in control of multiple dwelling sites and gain access to residential units occupied by voters.

Privacy and Personal Safety

There are an increasing number of residents, particularly those living in urban centres, who refuse to answer their doors out of fear for their personal safety or for reasons of privacy. Seniors, persons who live alone and new Canadians are the groups most hesitant to open their doors to enumerators. The concern for personal safety has also been shared by enumerators, who are required to work during the day and evenings visiting inner city and high crime neighbourhoods and remote locations.

Recruiting and Retaining Enumerators

There is also the challenge of recruiting, training and mobilizing 3,000 enumerators required for the job in Saskatchewan. It is becoming more difficult to find a sufficient pool of competent individuals willing to perform this type of work. Considering the majority of election workers tend to be female, the trend toward more women working outside the home has, no doubt, played a major role in reducing the pool of available enumeration staff. The economic necessity for some people to hold multiple part-time jobs and the surging economy in Saskatchewan have also affected the supply of this type of labour. In addition, there are age and residency restrictions that reduce the pool of potential workers. Enumerators must be eligible voters living in the constituency, which means that they must be Canadian citizens and at least eighteen years old.

Rural vs. Urban Enumeration

There are unique difficulties experienced in both urban and rural settings. The difficulties of conducting a thorough enumeration in urban settings have long been observed and noted in the reports of election administrators. However, it is becoming increasingly more problematic to obtain complete coverage in rural areas as well. One significant factor in rural areas is the trend towards more farm families working off the farm and outside of their communities. The vast distances between residences, the time required for enumeration travel, and the low payment received for this task are additional obstacles to a comprehensive rural enumeration. In some remote northern constituencies, there are few paved roads, no roads into some communities, and weather can often prevent fly-in visits.

In Saskatchewan's 2011 election, the prewrit enumeration period that followed Labour Day coincided with the fall harvest. This made it difficult to find enumerators to do the job and difficult to find residents at home to enumerate in some rural areas.

Quality of the Information Collected

A complete provincial enumeration is a massive undertaking for returning officers to manage. Considerable time pressures

exist to compile a comprehensive and accurate preliminary list of voters for distribution to candidates and parties, as well as for use at the advance and regular polls during the election. The legibility, accuracy and overall quality of the information collected are always problematic. The continual recollection of voter information required by enumeration can introduce errors in the data that may have been accurately captured on previous voters lists.

Labour Costs

Elections are a labour intensive activity. Approximately 75 percent of the cost of elections goes to fees and salaries. Doorto-door enumeration accounts for a very large portion of these labour costs. Fees paid to workers, training costs and travel can amount to as much or more than the cost to conduct the election itself. Efforts to recruit and retain competent enumerators have often focused on increasing the remuneration for this type of work, which adds to the burgeoning cost of elections. Provinces and territories often find themselves trying to compete with the rates paid to census workers, and federal and civic enumerators.

Summary

There is an inherent inefficiency in collecting voter information through enumeration and then discarding the list

that has been compiled. Most of the information collected about voters does not change from one election to another. There will always be new voters added to the rolls who gain eligibility by virtue of age, residency or citizenship, and others who must be removed from the list due to loss of residency or death. New housing stock will also continue to be added and some residential properties will be demolished. This is vital information that must be captured for the voters list to be an accurate compilation of citizens entitled to vote.

Most changes to a voters list are due to internal mobility—the movement of voters from one address to another within the province or constituency. There is a fundamental link between voters and their addresses because where they live determines where they vote. Elections Saskatchewan must not only know which citizens are eligible to vote, but where the voter lives at any given time. No voter registration system can accurately track all the demographic and eligibility changes that occur in the intervening time between elections, but there is considerable duplication of effort in an approach to voter registration that begins with a blank slate before each election and continually compiles lists of names and addresses which, for the most part, do not change.



4.0 Permanent Register of Voters

A permanent register of voters is a regularly updated database of all eligible voters. It is maintained and updated from reliable public sector data sources. A permanent register would contain all of the information that would normally be collected through door-to-door enumeration, as well as some additional unique information for linking records from different sources. Permanent registers exist for the purpose of allowing individual voters to vote only within a given constituency and at a given polling station.

Permanent registers are used in most western democratic countries for elections at different levels of government. Voter registration is compulsory in Australia, Germany and Belgium, which leads to more complete lists, and voluntary in the United States, France, Austria, Finland, Sweden and Great Britain.

Elections British Columbia was the first jurisdiction in Canada to develop a

permanent voter register in the 1940s. British Columbia was the only jurisdiction in Canada to have a permanent voter register until the 1990s, when a number of other jurisdictions in Canada moved to continuously maintained voter registers. Elections Canada dropped its long established post-writ enumeration system and replaced it with a continuous national voters list called the National Register of Electors in 1996. This occurred after a final door-to-door enumeration in April 1997. Soon after, nine other jurisdictions (Newfoundland and Labrador, Quebec, Ontario, Alberta, Prince Edward Island, Nunavut, Nova Scotia, Northwest Territories and New Brunswick) adopted their own registers.

At the provincial level, the existence of a permanent register of voters means the information can be used for other electoral purposes, such as supporting local government elections. This is particularly important in provinces such as New Brunswick and Quebec that have

responsibility for administering or supporting the conduct of municipal and school board elections. But many other jurisdictions with no mandated responsibility for local elections, such as Alberta, Manitoba and Nova Scotia, also create customized voters lists for use by local authorities.

All provinces and territories also share voters list information with Elections Canada through data sharing agreements. This helps to improve the quality of voters lists used by Elections Canada within the province or territory for federal elections. In turn, Elections Canada supplies voter register information to provinces and territories that maintain their own permanent registers (with the exception of Quebec) for the purpose of improving the coverage, currency and accuracy of those lists

5.0 Enumeration vs. Permanent Register

Every system of voter registration has its merits and shortcomings. One way to gauge the relative merits of a particular method of registering voters is to look at the quality of the information that it yields. There are three main components typically used to measure the quality of a voters list – currency, coverage and accuracy.

- Currency is a measure of the relative decay of information from the time it was collected to the time it is needed. It refers to whether the list is up-to-date, i.e. whether an individual named at a specific address continues to live there.
- Coverage or completeness refers to the percentage of voters on the list compared to the number of eligible persons in the constituency or province.
- Accuracy refers to whether the information on the list is correct in terms of not containing spelling mistakes, data entry errors or other inaccuracies, such as the inclusion of ineligible voters. It is the percentage of correctly listed names and addresses compared to the total number of names on the list.

CURRENCY

The degree to which a voters list produced through enumeration is current depends on how close the enumeration occurs prior to the election event.

Considering that the last enumeration that took place in Saskatchewan was conducted about two months before the November election, the voters list information that it produced would have been very current. The greater the gap between the collection of the information and its use, the more the currency of the information can degrade over time. The primary source of voters list degradation and loss of currency is voter mobility.

When discussing currency and a permanent register of voters, it is important to remember that a register is usually compiled, in the first instance, through enumeration. Therefore, at the time it is created, a permanent register will be as up-to-date as a voters list compiled through enumeration.

Maintaining currency of a permanent register requires collaboration between agencies supplying the information to keep it up-to-date, particularly where high mobility exists.

In addition to the updating that goes on continuously between elections, register information is updated at election time through a more limited enumeration process, referred to as targeted enumeration. The information is also updated through the same processes that are followed during the revision period and on polling day to add and correct information about eligible voters. Over time, the currency of a permanent register of voters can be maintained if good data sources are available and used to track changes in voter status and residency. A permanent register of voters can contain very current voter information. As seen in Table 1, the currency of the National Register of Electors information for Saskatchewan as of March 1, 2012 was estimated to be 87.6 percent.

TABLE 1: NATIONAL REGISTER OF ELECTORS CURRENCY FOR SELECTED JURISDICTIONS (AS OF MARCH 1, 2012)	2)
--	----

Province	Estimated Size of Electoral Population	Adjusted Electors on Register Release	Adjusted Percentage of Electors at Correct Residential Address (Currency)
Saskatchewan	772,036	711,616	87.6 percent
Manitoba	891,060	802,884	80.4 percent
Yukon	26,193	24,112	74.9 percent



COVERAGE

Enumeration in Saskatchewan involves approximately 3,000 workers going door-to-door to collect voter information. The massive canvassing effort is able to capture the majority of the eligible voter population. In a growing province like Saskatchewan, however, new residents and new citizens are constantly entering the electorate and it is a constant challenge for enumeration to effectively capture these new voters.

Enumeration coverage can suffer in the summer months because of the large number of people who are on vacation or otherwise absent from their homes. Enumeration coverage in the spring and fall can be affected in rural areas by agricultural operations such as seeding

and harvesting. In winter, inclement weather can have an adverse impact on the recruitment of enumerators and their willingness to make repeated calls, not to mention residents' eagerness to answer the door. Legislation recently introduced in Saskatchewan could see the date set for the next general election moved from the first Monday in November 2015 to the first Monday in April 2016. This may require enumeration to be conducted either six months before the election event (September 2015) or in February 2016. Winter is not a good time to enumerate in Saskatchewan.

The coverage of a permanent register of voters depends largely on the data sources used to create and maintain the information. In the interval between

elections, voter records are continuously updated from a variety of overlapping databases. The use of multiple data sources ensures the register is complete by tracking voter moves, identifying new voters, and purging deceased or otherwise ineligible voters.

The voters lists compiled through enumeration in Saskatchewan's 2011 provincial general election included 551,818 voters. This represented only 71.5 percent of the estimated number of eligible voters (772,036) in the province at the time. This rate is fairly low compared to the rates achieved in the most recent enumerations in Manitoba (79.8 percent) and Yukon (79.6 percent). Table 2 shows enumeration coverage for those jurisdictions.

TABLE 2: ENUMERATION COVERAGE FOR	SELECTED JURISDICTIONS
-----------------------------------	------------------------

Province	Enumeration Dates	Number of Days	Total Voters on List After Enumeration	Total Eligible Voters	Coverage
Sask.	Sept 8/11 – Sept 26/11	19	551,818	772,036	71.5 percent
Manitoba	July 21/11 - Aug 22/11	33	710,590	889,943	79.8 percent
Yukon	Sept 9/11 – Sept 22/11	13	18,018	22,643	79.6 percent

By comparison, as can be seen in Table 3, Elections Canada had an estimated 92.2 percent of eligible voters in Saskatchewan on its National Register in a similar time period. The coverage rates of Elections Canada's permanent register for Saskatchewan and Manitoba are 92.2 percent and 90.1 percent, respectively. The National Register of Electors has achieved an even higher coverage in Quebec (98.3 percent), New Brunswick (96.9 percent) and Nova Scotia (95.4 percent).

TABLE 3: NATIONAL REGISTER OF ELECTORS COVERAGE FOR SELECTED JURISDICTIONS (AS OF MARCH 1, 2012)

Province	Estimated Size of Electoral Population	Adjusted Electors on Register Release	Adjusted Percentage of Electors on Release (Coverage)
Saskatchewan	772,036	711,616	92.2 percent
Manitoba	891,060	802,884	90.1 percent
Yukon	26,193	24,112	92.1 percent

ACCURACY

The accuracy of a voters list compiled through enumeration depends on the quality of training workers receive, the design of the information collection tools, data entry and proofing procedures, and the overall management of the enumeration process. Incomplete and inaccurate information recorded at the door sets the stage for inaccuracies on the voters list.

What plagues enumeration is the fact that the voter information is being captured and recompiled each election with ample opportunity for errors. Information that was previously recorded accurately or corrected by the voter at the polling station can be re-recorded erroneously during a subsequent enumeration. Not only can this be frustrating for the voter, errors on the voters list can affect the ability of an election administrator to assign voters to the correct poll and to inform voters where they should go to vote. These inaccuracies can also affect the sorting of the voters list and the election officials' ability to find voters on the list at the polls. In some cases it can lead to disenfranchisement.

The major source of inaccuracy within permanent registers stems from database characteristics in general. Databases have errors that are usually caused by mistakes in data entry, such as the transposition of numbers or letters, but also from inaccurate information supplied by the individual. This would be no different for records created through enumeration. Fortunately, with the use of multiple data sources, there is a greater chance that errors will be caught and corrected. Many jurisdictions now have a wealth of experience with record matching to draw upon.

In addition to the quality measures addressed above, there are several other criteria that can be used to assess the merits of a particular system of voter registration.

OTHER FACTORS TO CONSIDER

Timeliness

Timeliness of the voters list information is important at any time, but never more crucial than when an election is called unexpectedly. Election administrators plan for "on demand" events, but it is not ideal to be scrambling to prepare a voters list. It is important for election administrators and returning officers to have an up-to-date voters list to create polling divisions and assign voters to their correct polls - and parties and candidates need this information sooner rather than later. Unexpected election calls will force an enumeration to be conducted within the writ period and prevent the voters list from being available until campaigning is well underway.

Voter information is always available with a permanent register. The information is continuously updated and voters lists can be produced on very short notice. Obviously this comes in handy with an unexpected election call, but also between elections when lists can be provided to political parties and elected Members. The ability to produce a voters list at any point in time during the planning and preparations for an election greatly assists election administrators and returning officers with the creation or revision of poll boundaries. It also affords them more time to conduct critical "in the field" proofing of the lists before going into an election.

Security and Privacy

Canadians have become increasingly more aware of and concerned about privacy of their personal information.

Securing the voters list from unauthorized use is very important. There are provisions in Saskatchewan to prohibit unauthorized use of information contained in voters lists, whether by election officials or by parties and candidates.

The information from an enumeration is collected by thousands of individuals and is later inputted by hundreds of data entry operators, sometimes using computers within their homes. Records can and do go missing in the transfer of information.

Privacy concerns exist wherever uniquely identifiable data relating to an individual are collected and stored. In some cases these concerns refer to how the data is collected, stored and linked. In other cases the issue relates to who is given access to the information. Concern over privacy protection is often raised when jurisdictions move to the creation of a permanent register of voters because the increased ability to gather, store and transmit information can have negative implications for the retention of privacy.

It is clear to the voter when information is collected through enumeration that it is intended to be used only for election purposes. The fact that it is collected each time there is an election reinforces this belief. It is not always as apparent when the information is collected from multiple sources, linked to other databases and stored for future use – as is the case with a permanent register of voters. More stringent laws that protect the privacy of voters list information can allay some of the concerns.

Greater measures are usually taken to protect the information stored in a permanent register than to protect voters list information compiled through



enumeration. Permanent register information can be securely stored on servers at the election office or at a secure remote location. When lists are produced from registers and transmitted to users, they are routinely encrypted. The information within a permanent register is shared with a more limited sphere of individuals, thereby minimizing the opportunity for breaches of security.

Alerting Voters

One of the often-cited advantages of enumeration is that the process of going door-to-door to compile the list prior to an election serves the purpose of reminding voters that an election has been called. While it is no doubt true that some voters may benefit from such a reminder, the impact of this form of "advertising" for the election event should not be overstated. Those responsible for administering elections are required by law to post notices and place ads in newspapers announcing the particulars of an election. They often conduct broader advertising using traditional media such as television, radio and billboards. More recently, Facebook, Twitter, Internet forums, blogs and other social media have been used to push the message to the public. Most election offices also mail

voter information cards to eligible voters informing them of the various voting options available and where to cast ballots on polling day. Finally, there is no shortage of advertising using these same approaches by election campaigns in the weeks, and sometimes months, leading up to an election. Considering all this activity, it is difficult to imagine that most voters are not aware of an impending election by polling day.

Table 4 provides a comparative summary of the important factors to consider in assessing the quality of voter registration methods.

Factors to Consider	Enumeration	Comments	Permanent Register	Comments
Currency	High	When voter list compiled close to election.	Medium	Depends on the frequency of information updates.Can be updated continuously.
Coverage	Medium	 Depends on the duration and completeness of enumeration. More challenging to collect information at the door. 	High	 When using multiple data sources to update. Depends on the quality of overlapping data sources.
Accuracy	Medium	Recollection of information every election leads to error.	High	With continuous updating, errors can be caught and corrected.
Timeliness	Low	Produced just before an election.Not available between elections.	High	 Always available to Members and candidates. Available any time for election officials to prepare for an election.
Security/ Privacy	Medium	Greater potential for breaches.	High	More precautions can be taken to protect voters.
Alerting Voters	High	Enumerator on doorstep serves as a reminder of the election.	High	Greater potential for accurate and timely communications.

6.0 Comparing the Costs

It is difficult to obtain a detailed account of the comparative costs between enumeration and a permanent register from other jurisdictions. At the time most provinces and territories moved from enumeration to a permanent register, few conducted this type of analysis. The information that does exist often cites a sizable cost savings as a major advantage of a permanent voter register. As noted earlier, the costs of enumeration are considerable and they are growing every election as efforts are made to overcome the ever-increasing hurdles to obtaining a complete list of eligible voters.

The initial cost of a permanent register includes systems development, hardware, software and personnel, as well as the ongoing costs to maintaining a register. But, one of the major benefits of a permanent register is its long-term savings. The costs of maintaining a permanent voter register are offset, to some degree, through the use of National Register of Electors information from Elections Canada. The cost of maintaining the National Register is borne entirely by Elections Canada and this information can be readily obtained at no cost by Elections Saskatchewan.

The creation of a permanent voter register by Saskatchewan and the sharing of that information with municipalities and school boards can result in considerable cost savings for the recipients. Many local governments would benefit from receiving high quality voters list information customized for their political boundaries.

ENUMERATION COSTS

It was previously noted that enumeration costs are made up largely of labour costs – fees for enumerators, revising agents, data entry operators and salaries for returning officers, election clerks and other office staff.

In 2011. Elections Saskatchewan conducted a province-wide enumeration outside of the writ period. The enumeration employed nearly 3,000 workers and occurred over a nineteenday period beginning on September 8 and ending on September 26. The total cost of the enumeration/revision was \$3,225,000. In estimating the cost savings associated with moving to a permanent register, it is necessary to exclude the costs of revision since this would be conducted under either scenario. In doing so, the \$645,000 in fees paid to revising agents, and a portion of returning officer and election clerk salaries, mileage, data entry, office and equipment rental and supply costs were removed from the total. The resulting amount strictly for enumeration is estimated at \$2,580,000.

While there are not many comparisons to make since there are so few jurisdictions that still conduct province-wide enumerations, Saskatchewan's costs compare favourably to the examples that could be found. For example, compared to Saskatchewan's per voter cost of \$5.34, the cost for Manitoba's last enumeration in 2011 was \$6.00 per voter. Yukon's enumeration in the fall of 2011 cost \$7.77 per voter.

PERMANENT REGISTER COSTS

In order to decide if moving to a permanent register is justifiable on the basis of cost, it is necessary to estimate the initial cost of establishing a register and the continuing costs of maintaining it. By comparing these costs with the known costs of continuing to enumerate, it can be determined if a permanent register will be more or less costly. The two basic cost components of establishing a permanent register are development costs and ongoing maintenance costs.

Development Costs

Elections Saskatchewan has its own customized election management software called Elections Saskatchewan's Permanent Register of Eligible Electors (ESPREE). The same system is used by Alberta, the Northwest Territories and Nunavut to manage elections and permanent registers of voters. In Alberta, the system is used by Elections Alberta to house and maintain its Register of Electors that contains records for more than 2.5 million voters. In order to serve as a register for Saskatchewan, ESPREE could benefit from some enhanced functionality to allow elector and address information to be updated from external data sources. This would include databases from other agencies. The estimated cost for this work to be performed by an external developer is \$50,000.

A permanent voter register will require a more robust server environment that has the ability to handle an increase in requests and is able to scale up to accommodate periods of high demand.



Two new servers and software will be required to bring the current environment to a level that will meet these requirements. One application/web server and one database server would need to be added to the current server environment. The cost per server is \$5,000 and Windows server and database licensing costs would be approximately \$15,000 for both.

In its present location, Elections Saskatchewan would likely require a fibre optic communication line. Currently, the connection between the data centre located at the Legislative Assembly Building can only achieve a maximum speed of 5 MB. Fibre optics would allow for speeds of up to 1GB, but even speeds of 20 MB or 100 MB would be a significant improvement. This upgrade would benefit all information technology related services at Elections Saskatchewan, but would be particularly helpful in providing users with improved and faster access to a large register database stored on the servers. The one-time cost of this upgrade is estimated to be \$15,000.

Eventually the system could benefit from an on-line application to permit voters to manage their own voter registration. An on-line application similar to Alberta's VoterLink, would cost approximately \$50,000 to build, but would not need to be developed until after the 2015 (or 2016) general election.

Table 5 summarizes the estimated development costs for a permanent register of voters.

Activity/Item	Cost	
Systems development	\$50,000	
Two servers	\$10,000	
Server and database licensing	\$15,000	
Fibre optic communication	\$15,000	
Miscellaneous, hardware, software, furniture and supplies	\$35,000	
Total	\$125,000	

Maintenance Costs

A permanent register of voters would need to be continuously updated to maintain acceptable levels of currency and coverage. This involves significant organization and management of the database, as well as programming to establish automated routines for matching databases and updating records. Two additional in-house technical positions would need to be added to the IT staff – a Business Analyst and a Database Programmer. It would be highly desirable for these two additional positions to be filled at the outset so that

they could be involved in the planning and development of the new register system.

Once the register system has been designed and implemented and additional databases have been acquired to update the register records, two additional Data Analyst positions will be required to continuously review register records; manually input registration additions, changes and deletions; perform "look-up" functions; and resolve isolated issues. Based on current rates, in a typical four-year election cycle the maintenance costs

for a permanent register of voters in Saskatchewan would be \$1,313,600. These costs are not expected to increase at the same rate as the costs of enumeration. Evidence from other jurisdictions suggests that these costs are also unlikely to increase substantially over time as staff becomes more efficient at maintaining it.

Table 6 summarizes the estimated annual maintenance costs for a permanent register in Saskatchewan.

Position/Item	Annual Cost
Business Analyst (MCP5/6)	\$93,500
Database Programmer (MCP5/6)	\$93,500
Two Data Analysts (MCP2)	\$92,400
Fibre optic communication charges	\$ 9,000
Miscellaneous hardware, software and supplies	\$40,000
Total	\$328,400 (current costs)

Target Enumeration Costs

Jurisdictions that have permanent registers usually conduct some form of targeted enumeration prior to an election. The purpose of this more limited form of enumeration is to increase the coverage and currency of the voters lists by focusing efforts on areas of new growth and high mobility. It is designed to capture voters who may have recently moved within the province or who have just become qualified to vote in the election by virtue of gaining residency or age eligibility. The amount of enumeration in each constituency will vary depending on the particular characteristics of voters and housing within it. For instance,

constituencies that are highly stable will have less targeted enumeration and ones with lots of apartments, student housing and new growth will have more.

For purposes of establishing the target enumeration costs, it was estimated that 15 percent of the total enumeration costs would continue to be incurred for targeted enumeration prior to an election. This is probably an overcautious estimate of the amount of enumeration that would be required, but prudent nonetheless until the register quality has been measured. Target enumeration each election is estimated to cost \$384,000.

COST SAVING OF A PERMANENT REGISTER OF VOTERS

Based on the actual costs of enumeration in Saskatchewan and the estimated costs of maintaining a permanent register of voters, it can be seen in Table 7 that a net saving of \$882,400 could be realized every four-year election cycle by moving to a permanent register. The cost of continuing to enumerate would be almost 38 percent more than the cost of maintaining a permanent register. However, the net savings would be \$125,000 less in the first four-year election cycle due to the initial development costs.

Four-year Cycle Cost Components	Enumeration	Permanent Register	Total Four-Year Cycle Cost Saving
Enumeration	\$2,580,000		
Revision	\$645,000	\$645,000	
Target enumeration		\$384,000	
Maintenance costs		1,313,600	
Total Four-year Cycle Costs	\$3,225,000	\$2,342,600	\$882,40



7.0 Timing of Implementation

The development of a permanent register could begin immediately once the legislative authority is in place and proposed IT positions are filled. At that time, work can commence on building the register, negotiating data sharing agreements, developing business rules for incorporating new voters and

modifying existing records, developing data matching and updating routines, and establishing audit controls. These tasks will be undertaken with resources from Elections Saskatchewan and the agencies providing data. These agencies should be involved from the outset in planning and implementing a permanent register.

In the fall of 2015, there will be a "final" comprehensive enumeration. There are several options for compiling the voters list for the 2015 general election. Those options are listed in Table 8.

TABLE 0.	ADTIONIC FAD	2015 ELECTION

Option	Features	Pros/Cons	
1. Status Quo – Enumeration	Enumeration conducted with blank forms.	Pros Established procedure. No new training required. Cons Greater potential for data collection error. No address standards applied.	
2. Enumerate using pre- filled addresses on forms	 Makes use of Saskatchewan's new Civic Address Register (CAR). Forms pre-printed with all addresses in the province. 	Pros Potentially more comprehensive enumeration – all known addresses to be visited. Makes use of standard addressing – improved postal delivery of voter cards. Cons Some standard addresses may not match what's on voter's identification. CAR doesn't distinguish between residential and commercial addresses.	
3. Enumerate using pre- filled voter information from 2011 list	 One form per address with all voters listed. Names can be easily confirmed, deleted or added to form. 	Pros More efficient - data already collected and corrected gets reused. Less costly data entry. Cons Only 71.5 percent of eligible voters enumerated in 2011. No address standards applied.	
4. Enumerate using pre- filled voter information from 2011 list and federal register	 One form per address with all known provincial and federal voters included. Confirmation process for most voters. New addresses would require blank forms. 	Pros Approximately 90 percent of voters would simply need to be confirmed. Most efficient enumeration and data entry process. Opportunity to partner with Elections Canada. Cons Skills to combine list not readily available. Amendments needed to legislation to access federal list.	

The permanent register of voters system will initially be populated with voter data compiled from the selected enumeration option. After the next general election (2015 or 2016), the enumeration records contained in the register will be updated

and new voter data from reliable public sector sources will be added to the register to keep it current. Ongoing quality research will be conducted to measure the currency, completeness and accuracy of the register information.

This will determine if any gaps exist and will help to focus target enumeration prior to the following general election.

Saskatchewan's permanent voter register will be ready for use in the 2019 general election.

8.0 Guiding Principles

In deciding whether to move forward with a permanent register of voters for Saskatchewan, it is helpful to consider a list of principles that should be upheld by any change in the way voter registration is carried out. Decision makers may feel more comfortable authorizing the establishment of a permanent register when they are satisfied these conditions can be met. Following is a list of principles for the establishment of a permanent register of voters derived, in part, and adapted from information included in the Royal Commission on Electoral Reform and Party Financing report (1991). The ability of Elections Saskatchewan to meet these principles is assessed below:

A permanent register of voters should be adopted only if it is comparable to enumeration in terms of currency and coverage.

The experience of other Canadian jurisdictions that have already established permanent registers is that their voters list currency and coverage compare quite favorably with the results of enumeration. Permanent registers can achieve a very high level of currency. For example, the currency of the National Register of Electors for Saskatchewan was 87.6 percent as of March 1, 2012. Permanent lists can achieve even higher levels of currency

as evidenced by the National Register of Electors rates of 95.2 percent in PEI, 92 percent in Quebec and 90.1 percent in Nova Scotia for this same time period.

Coverage of the voters list following Saskatchewan's last election was 71.5 percent. This rate is fairly low compared to the rates achieved in the most recent enumeration in Manitoba (79.8 percent). The coverage rates of Elections Canada's permanent register for Saskatchewan and Manitoba are 92.2 percent and 90.1 percent, respectively. The National Register of Electors has achieved an even higher coverage in Quebec (98.3 percent), New Brunswick (96.9 percent) and Nova Scotia (95.4 percent).

A permanent register should only be adopted if it is nearly as efficient as enumeration.

Based on the actual costs of enumeration in Saskatchewan and the estimated costs of establishing and maintaining a permanent register of voters, it can be seen that the annual cost of continuing to enumerate would be \$220,600 more or approximately 38 percent greater than the cost of maintaining a register - \$806,250 versus \$585,650 (current costs). In the first 4-year election cycle, which would

include development costs, the cost saving of moving to a permanent register would amount to \$757,400 (current cost). In the next full 4-year election cycle, the savings would be \$882,400 (current cost).

A permanent register must ensure that it is at least as easy as it is through enumeration for eligible voters to be placed on the voters list.

Registering voters via a permanent register requires minimal effort on the part of the voter. Registers are, for the most part, kept current with information that has already been provided to other agencies. If a voter is not on the register prior to the election, they could be added during revision, at the advance polls or at their voting station on polling day.

A permanent register must be designed to include all eligible voters.

Both enumeration and permanent registers have the inclusion of all eligible voters as their goals. The challenge for a permanent register is to draw upon many and varied official sources for the purpose of including new voters and keeping voter records up-to-date.



A permanent register should be open, such that voters can be included on the list after the writs for the election have been issued up to and including on polling day.

Keeping a permanent register open, such that eligible voters will not be disenfranchised simply because they were not on the list prior to an election call, is fairly straightforward. Currently, jurisdictions that use permanent registers continue to incorporate a revision period within their election calendar and permit voter registration at the advance poll and on polling day.

Voters should have the right not to be included on the register or to have their name removed at any time.

Permitting voters to have their names kept off of a permanent register is accomplished through legislative authority and administrative procedure. Voters wishing to be excluded from the register would need to inform election administrators of this preference, verify their identity, and they can then be deleted from future register updates. This would not affect their entitlement to vote, as they would simply need to register at their voting station when they go to vote.

Permitting voters to have their names removed from the register would require a similar application procedure. This could take place at any time prior to the printing and distribution of the voters lists for an election.

Voters should be able to have register information corrected at any time.

Permitting voters to have their personal information corrected would follow a similar administrative procedure as the exclusion and deletion from the register.

A permanent register must be designed so as to prevent voter fraud, i.e. by minimizing the inclusion of people that are not eligible voters.

The same system checks to prevent voter fraud—such as proof of identification and challenges to a voter's eligibility during revision and at the polls by candidate representatives and election officials—are in place for a permanent register. Additionally, a permanent register benefits from the verification procedures that are in place when an official record is created.

Information on the register must be managed according to the strictest criteria for preserving privacy and safeguarding confidentiality.

Separate provisions for the protection of privacy and confidentiality of voter information can be included along with legislation authorizing the establishment of a register of voters for Saskatchewan.

9.0 Recommendations

BOARD OF INTERNAL ECONOMY CONSENSUS

Based on the evidence collected within this study, the Chief Electoral Officer recommends that a permanent registry be instituted in Saskatchewan. The Chief Electoral Officer is seeking consensus among the members of the Board of Internal Economy on whether a permanent register of voters should be pursued.

LEGISLATIVE AMENDMENTS

The Chief Electoral Officer is seeking the support of the Board of Internal Economy in requesting legislative changes to *The Elections Act, 1996* that would authorize

the establishment, management and maintenance of a permanent register of voters.

Legislative amendments will be required on a timely basis to give Elections Saskatchewan adequate lead time to make the extensive operational and system changes that will be required to prepare for the implementation of a permanent register in 2019. It is recommended that the necessary amendments be passed in 2014, prior to the next general election, with transitioning provisions to have them come into effect following the 2015 (or 2016) election. These amendments are critical for this initiative to proceed.

Legislative drafting instructions have been prepared by Elections Saskatchewan and can be made available to legislative counsel staff.

ADDITIONAL RESOURCES

In preparing to construct a permanent register of voters, Elections
Saskatchewan will require additional permanent staff positions and accompanying salary and operating funds in its 2014-15 budget. The additional resources are essential to the development and ongoing maintenance of a permanent register of voters for Saskatchewan.



Acknowledgements

The Chief Electoral Officer would like to thank the staff of Elections Saskatchewan and other election management bodies across the country for sharing their experience, providing advice, answering questions, and offering insight into this assessment. Their contributions should be fully acknowledged. He is also grateful for the ongoing advice offered by Lorne Gibson, known across the country for his expertise in voter registration, in studying the potential for a permanent register of voters for Saskatchewan.

Elections Saskatchewan Regina, Saskatchewan 1702 Park Street Regina, Saskatchewan S4N 6B2 Telephone: 306.787.4000 Toll Free: 1.877.958.8683 Fax: 306.787.4052

E-Mail: info@elections.sk.ca www.elections.sk.ca